Andreas Krause

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ To assess the impact capital structure decisions have on company value, we can compare the value of companies with different levels of debt

- To assess the impact capital structure decisions have on company value, we can compare the value of companies with different levels of debt
- Company value here refers to the value of debt and equity combined

▶ To assess the impact capital structure decisions have on company value, we can compare the value of companies with different levels of debt

▶ Company value here refers to the value of debt and equity combined

▶ This value will be based on the ability of the company to generate profits

- To assess the impact capital structure decisions have on company value, we can compare the value of companies with different levels of debt
- Company value here refers to the value of debt and equity combined
- This value will be based on the ability of the company to generate profits

▶ Companies generate an identical surplus from its investment in the next time period

▶ V

▶ Companies generate an identical surplus from its investment in the next time period

▶ If the company has no debt, this surplus is accruing to its equity holders

▶ $V \rightarrow \hat{E}$

▶ Companies generate an identical surplus from its investment in the next time period

▶ If the company has no debt, this surplus is accruing to its equity holders

▶ $V \rightarrow \hat{E}$

▶ If the company has debt, this surplus is accruing to equity holders

▶ $V \rightarrow E$

Levered and unlevered companies

- Companies generate an identical surplus from its investment in the next time period
- If the company has no debt, this surplus is accruing to its equity holders
- $V \rightarrow \hat{E}$
- If the company has debt, this surplus is accruing to equity holders and lenders
- $V \rightarrow E + L$

▶ Companies generate an identical surplus from its investment in the next time period

▶ If the company has no debt, this surplus is accruing to its equity holders

▶ $V \rightarrow \hat{E}$

▶ If the company has debt, this surplus is accruing to equity holders and lenders

▶ $V \rightarrow E + L$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ If a company has debt, its equity holders will only obtain the surplus

▶ $E \rightarrow V$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ If a company has debt, its equity holders will only obtain the surplus less the loan repayment

▶ $E \rightarrow V - \qquad L$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ If a company has debt, its equity holders will only obtain the surplus less the loan repayment including interest

▶ $E \rightarrow V - (1 + r_L) L$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ If a company has debt, its equity holders will only obtain the surplus less the loan repayment including interest

▶ $E \rightarrow V - (1 + r_L) L$

▶ Suppose an investor makes the same equity investment into the unlevered company as in the levered company

► Suppose an investor makes the same equity investment into the unlevered company as in the levered company

► When investing into the unlevered company he also takes out a loan

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ Suppose an investor makes the same equity investment into the unlevered company as in the levered company

▶ When investing into the unlevered company he also takes out a loan such that he obtains a fraction $\frac{E+L}{\hat{E}}$ of the company

- Suppose an investor makes the same equity investment into the unlevered company as in the levered company
- When investing into the unlevered company he also takes out a loan such that he obtains a fraction $\frac{E+L}{\hat{E}}$ of the company
- He will receive his fraction of the surplus
- $E \to \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V$

- Suppose an investor makes the same equity investment into the unlevered company as in the levered company
- When investing into the unlevered company he also takes out a loan such that he obtains a fraction $\frac{E+L}{\hat{E}}$ of the company
- He will receive his fraction of the surplus and repay his loan including interest
- $E \rightarrow \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

▶ Suppose an investor makes the same equity investment into the unlevered company as in the levered company

▶ When investing into the unlevered company he also takes out a loan such that he obtains a fraction $\frac{E+L}{\hat{E}}$ of the company

▶ He will receive his fraction of the surplus and repay his loan including interest

▶ $E \rightarrow \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

▶ As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical

- As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical
- $V - (1 + r_L) L = \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

▶ As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical

▶ $V - (1 + r_L) L = \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

$\Rightarrow \hat{E} = E + L = V$

- As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical
- $V - (1 + r_L) L = \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$
- $\Rightarrow \hat{E} = E + L = V$
- $\Rightarrow$ The company value is independent of the capital structure

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

Indifference to the form of financing

▶ As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical

▶ $V - (1 + r_L) L = \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

$\Rightarrow$ $\hat{E} = E + L = V$

$\Rightarrow$ The company value is independent of the capital structure

▶ This is known as the Modigliani-Miller theorem

▶ As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical

▶ $V - (1 + r_L) L = \frac{E+L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

$\Rightarrow$ $\hat{E} = E + L = V$

$\Rightarrow$ The company value is independent of the capital structure

▶ This is known as the Modigliani-Miller theorem or the irrelevance of the capital structure

▶ As both initial investments were identical, the outcome must be identical

▶ $V - (1 + r_L) L = \frac{E + L}{\hat{E}} V - (1 + r_L) L$

$\Rightarrow$ $\hat{E} = E + L = V$

$\Rightarrow$ The company value is independent of the capital structure

▶ This is known as the Modigliani-Miller theorem or the irrelevance of the capital structure

▶ The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders

Equity values

- ▶ The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity

▶ The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity

▶ For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates

▶ $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^\tau}$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity

▶ For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates

▶ $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^{\tau}} = \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E}$

Equity values

▶ The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity

▶ For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates

▶ $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^\tau} = \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E}$

▶ For the levered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates

▶ $E = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+r_E)^\tau}$

Equity values

- The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity
- For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates
- $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^\tau} = \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E}$
- For the levered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates less the interest on the loan
- $E = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V - r_L L}{(1+r_E)^\tau}$

Equity values

► The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity

► For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates

► $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^\tau} = \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E}$

► For the levered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates less the interest on the loan

► $E = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V-r_L L}{(1+r_E)^\tau} = \frac{V-r_L L}{r_E}$

Equity values

- The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity
- For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates
- $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^\tau} = \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E}$
- For the levered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates less the interest on the loan
- $E = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V - r_L L}{(1+r_E)^\tau} = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E}$
- The discount rates of the two companies might be different as they are financed in a different way

Equity values

- The value of equity is given from the surplus accruing to the equity holders, discounted at the appropriate cost of equity
- For the unlevered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates
- $\hat{E} = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V}{(1+\hat{r}_E)^\tau} = \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E}$
- For the levered company the surplus consists of the total surplus the company generates less the interest on the loan
- $E = \sum_{\tau=1}^{+\infty} \frac{V-r_L L}{(1+r_E)^\tau} = \frac{V-r_L L}{r_E}$
- The discount rates of the two companies might be different as they are financed in a different way

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E}$

► The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

► $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E} = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E} = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

$\quad = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \hat{E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E} = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

$\quad = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \hat{E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} (E + L) - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E} = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

$= \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \hat{E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} (E + L) - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

⇒ $r_E = \hat{r}_E + (\hat{r}_E - r_L) \frac{L}{E}$

Cost of equity

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E} = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

$\qquad = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \hat{E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} (E + L) - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

⇒ $r_E = \hat{r}_E + (\hat{r}_E - r_L) \frac{L}{E}$

⇒ The cost of equity increases with leverage

▶ The relationship between these discount rates can now be obtained from the equity value

▶ $E = \frac{V - r_L L}{r_E} = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \frac{V}{\hat{r}_E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

   $\qquad = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} \hat{E} - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L = \frac{\hat{r}_E}{r_E} (E + L) - \frac{r_L}{r_E} L$

$\Rightarrow r_E = \hat{r}_E + (\hat{r}_E - r_L) \frac{L}{E}$

$\Rightarrow$ The cost of equity increases with leverage

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

▶ The weighted average cost of capital consist of the cost of equity and costs of debt

▶ $r_{\text{WACC}} = \textcolor{red}{r_E} \qquad + \textcolor{blue}{r_L}$

▶ The weighted average cost of capital consist of the cost of equity and costs of debt, with their weights in the financing of the company

▶ $r_{\text{WACC}} = r_E \frac{E}{E+L} + r_L \frac{L}{E+L}$

▶ The weighted average cost of capital consist of the cost of equity and costs of debt, with their weights in the financing of the company

▶ $r_{\text{WACC}} = r_E \frac{E}{E+L} + r_L \frac{L}{E+L}$

$\Rightarrow$ $r_{\text{WACC}} = \hat{r}_E$

The irrelevance of capital structure decisions

Weighted average cost of capital

▶ The weighted average cost of capital consist of the cost of equity and costs of debt, with their weights in the financing of the company

▶ $r_{\text{WACC}} = r_E \frac{E}{E+L} + r_L \frac{L}{E+L}$

⇒ $r_{\text{WACC}} = \hat{r}_E$

▶ The weighted average cost of capital is unaffected by the capital structure

▶ The weighted average cost of capital consist of the cost of equity and costs of debt, with their weights in the financing of the company

▶ $r_{\mathsf{WACC}} = r_E \frac{E}{E+L} + r_L \frac{L}{E+L}$

⇒ $r_{\mathsf{WACC}} = \hat{r}_E$

▶ The weighted average cost of capital is unaffected by the capital structure

▶ The increase in the cost of equity as leverage increases is compensated for by the use of lower-cost loans

Weighted average cost of capital

► The weighted average cost of capital consist of the cost of equity and costs of debt, with their weights in the financing of the company

► $r_{\text{WACC}} = r_E \frac{E}{E+L} + r_L \frac{L}{E+L}$

⇒ $r_{\text{WACC}} = \hat{r}_E$

► The weighted average cost of capital is unaffected by the capital structure

► The increase in the cost of equity as leverage increases is compensated for by the use of lower-cost loans

Andreas Krause
Department of Economics
University of Bath
Claverton Down
Bath BA2 7AY
United Kingdom

E-mail: mnsak@bath.ac.uk