When being professional means becoming myself: towards integrity and presence in practice

David Martin Adams

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
University of Bath
School of Management
Centre for Action Research in Professional Practice (CARPP)

April 2011

COPYRIGHT
Attention is drawn to the fact that copyright of this thesis rests with its author. A copy of this thesis has been supplied on condition that anyone who consults it is understood to recognise that its copyright rests with the author and they must not copy it or use material from it except as permitted by law or with the consent of the author.

RESTRICTIONS ON USE
This thesis may be made available for consultation within the University Library and may be photocopied or lent to other libraries for the purposes of consultation.

Signed
The true professional is one who does not obscure grace with illusions of technical prowess, the true professional is one who strips away all illusions to reveal a reliable truth a reliable truth in which the human heart can rest.

Margaret Wheatley
The True Professional
(2009)
Table of Contents

Front Piece: The True Professional ii

Table of Contents iii

Abstract vi

Acknowledgements vii

1. Introduction 1
   Ways of Seeing 6
   Labelling and Naming 9
   Metaphors of the Journey 12
   Thinking and Acting Professionally 15
   Validity/Quality 17
   Ethical Considerations 23
   The Thesis 27

Interlude: The Voyage with Brendan 32

2. Facing into the Wind 44
   The Fodder of Experience 45
   Inquiry in Action 51
   Relational Inquiry 56
   Systemic Inquiry 60
   Writing as Inquiry 64
   Narrative Inquiry 70
   A Religious Quest 75
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. First You Have to Row a Little Boat</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognising Different Sources of Knowledge</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aspirations of Phronetic Practice</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living My Inquiry</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing the Inquiry</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Different Way of Knowing</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Blind Spot</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Sense in Embarrassment</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arriving in the Moment</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reflective Process</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beyond Reflective Practice</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Shortest Distance Between Two Points is a Zigzag Line</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Mentor or Not to Mentor</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards Haptic Vision</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Putting Heart and Soul into Research</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborative Inquiry</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking a Relational Attitude to Inquiry</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Relational Ontology</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrestling with Control</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glimpsing the Perichoresis</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value or Virtue?</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. I Listen to the Wind and the Wind Tells Me What to Do</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When a Teacher Becomes a Learner</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding a Language for Learning</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Into the Mainstream</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navigating Systems</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management by Grenade</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermission: The Wisdom of an Ass</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking and Acting in Systems</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 12th 2008</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. I Hear the White Bird Speak for the First Time 220
   Crossing the Threshold 225
   Finding My Voice 230
   Chasing After Wind 237
   Confronting Hubris 245
   Becoming Myself 252

References 266
Abstract

This thesis seeks to elaborate the inner qualities of integrity and presence in professional practice. It is offered as a contribution to the growing body of literature that shifts the emphasis in professional development from the transfer of skills and knowledge to the transformation of practice. Professional education has been viewed as the acquisition of the knowledge and skills required to address the presenting problems of daily practice. It has been assumed that the answers to these problems can be identified, codified and passed on to others, resulting in a kind of professionalism by protocol. But, as Dreyfus & Dreyfus (2005) have pointed out, there is a qualitative shift in the practice of experts when compared to novices and beginners. The expert evidences a deliberative skill that does not rely on the application of protocols but on extensive case by case experience. Indeed professionalism may be understood as the quality of practice that is evident at the very moment when protocols no longer apply (Coles 2002).

Professional practice is not a simple concept as Kemmis (2006) has shown. The thesis contributes to this field by suggesting that professionalism is acquired through prolonged inquiry into the contingencies of quotidian practice and that this shapes the inner qualities the practitioner brings to their practice. It is offered as a first person inquiry (Reason 2001) that probes fractals of my own professional practice over a five year period. In telling my personal story, I give an account of an emergent methodology that engages with action research and narrative inquiry. A narrative mode of knowing (Bruner 1986) notices the complex, many sided and sometimes conflicting stories of professional life resulting, not in a set of propositional claims, but in an account that provides the reader with the imaginal space to enter the process and participate, with me, in making sense of professional practice.
Acknowledgements

To professional colleagues with whom I have worked in many different contexts around the world and whose fingerprints are all over this thesis. Thank you. To my students, going back to the earliest days of my work as a media trainer in India and Africa, you have taught me more than I could ever have learned in other ways. In particular to all those with whom I have collided who have had the courage to talk back, to question my arrogance and push against my hubris. In this resistance has been my learning. Thank you.

To all the writers whose work has stimulated my thinking and challenged my behaviour. Thank you. For too long I have been a consumer. It is now time for me to put something back. This is my response. This is how your ideas have entered my story.

To colleagues from the Centre for Action Research in Professional Practice at the University of Bath. At different stages in my journey I have experienced and valued the support and encouragement of my supervision groups. In particular I want to acknowledge the gentle push of Geoff Mead, my supervisor, whose sense of what was emerging in my work was often sharper than my own and whose encouragement to continue living inquiringly has provided momentum and energy to my work. Thank you.

To Wanda, wife, musician, and homemaker. This has been our shared performance. Without her patient encouragement and support this journey could not have been undertaken, and certainly not completed. She has often said she has played second fiddle to a book. Now that the “book” has been written, perhaps I can give her more of my attention.

This story finds its unexpected climax in death. And yet, even in death there is the promise of new beginnings, particularly in the birth of our first grandchild, Ava Grace, whose arrival blessed the closing stages of this journey.